

Show that any binary relation that is both reflexive and Euclidean is transitive, i.e., show that

$$\forall x Rxx, (\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz) \vdash (\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz).$$

(1)  $\forall x Rxx$

Prem

(2)  $\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$

Prem

As always, first write down your premises, leave some blank space, and write down your conclusion.

(14)  $(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz) \quad \forall \text{Int} \times 3 \quad 14$

(1)  $\forall x Rxx$  Prem

(2)  $\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$  Prem

---

(14)  $(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$   $\forall$ Int $\times$ 3 14

Next, look at the conclusion. What is the main operator(s)?  
What strategy does it suggest?

(1)  $\forall x Rxx$  Prem

(2)  $\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$  Prem

---

(14)  $(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$   $\forall \text{Int} \times 3$  14

Since it is a sequence of three  $\forall$ s, we will reach 10 by using  $\forall \text{Int} \times 3$ .

(1)  $\forall x Rxx$  Prem

(2)  $\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$  Prem

---

(14)  $(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$   $\forall \text{Int} \times 3$  14

As a result, what formula should be taken as subgoal?

(1)  $\forall x Rxx$  Prem

(2)  $\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$  Prem

---

(13)  $Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$  CP 3-12

(14)  $(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$   $\forall\text{Int} \times 3$  14

Notice that the choice of  $a, b, c$  doesn't matter, as long as the two conditions on  $\forall\text{Int}$  (remember?) are met.

(1)  $\forall x Rxx$  Prem

(2)  $\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$  Prem

---

(13)  $Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$  CP 3-12

(14)  $(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$   $\forall$ Int $\times$ 3 14

Now, this subgoal is a conditional. So our sub-subgoal is a CP.

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem				
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem				
(3)	<table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding-right: 5px; vertical-align: middle;"> <table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-bottom: 5px;"><math>Rab \wedge Rbc</math></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rac</math></td> </tr> </table> </td> <td style="padding-left: 5px;"></td> </tr> </table>	<table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-bottom: 5px;"><math>Rab \wedge Rbc</math></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rac</math></td> </tr> </table>	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	$Rac$		Supp
<table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-bottom: 5px;"><math>Rab \wedge Rbc</math></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rac</math></td> </tr> </table>	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	$Rac$				
$Rab \wedge Rbc$						
$Rac$						
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12				
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	$\forall$ Int $\times$ 3 14				

As always, for CP, we write the antecedent of the subgoal on the first line of the subproof, and the consequence on the last line.

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem
(3)	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp
	$Rac$	
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	$\forall$ Int $\times$ 3 14

Here's a good trick for such deductions: Make  $Rac$  match the consequent of the second premise, to reach our sub-subgoal by MP.

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem									
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem									
(3)	<table style="border-collapse: collapse; width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding-right: 5px;"></td> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-left: 5px;"><math>Rab \wedge Rbc</math></td> <td style="padding-left: 10px;">Supp</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding-right: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding-left: 5px;"><math>R_a \wedge R_c \rightarrow Rac</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding-right: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding-left: 5px;"><math>Rac</math></td> <td></td> </tr> </table>		$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp		$R_a \wedge R_c \rightarrow Rac$			$Rac$		
	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp									
	$R_a \wedge R_c \rightarrow Rac$										
	$Rac$										
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12									
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	$\forall$ Int $\times$ 3 14									

That means we'll instantiate  $y$  with  $a$  and  $z$  with  $c$  in line 2.

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem
(3)	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp
	$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	
	$Rac$	
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	$\forall$ Int $\times$ 3 14

But what will we instantiate  $x$  with? We'll try to match information we've already got.  $b$  would be a good guess.

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem
(3)	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp
	$Rba \wedge Rbc$ $Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$ $Rac$	
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	$\forall$ Int $\times$ 3 14

Let's try to deduce the antecedent to set up our MP.

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem														
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem														
(3)	<table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding-right: 5px;"> <table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-bottom: 5px;"><math>Rab \wedge Rbc</math></td> <td style="padding-left: 5px;">Supp</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rba</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rbc</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rba \wedge Rbc</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rac</math></td> <td></td> </tr> </table> </td> <td></td> </tr> </table>	<table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-bottom: 5px;"><math>Rab \wedge Rbc</math></td> <td style="padding-left: 5px;">Supp</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rba</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rbc</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rba \wedge Rbc</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rac</math></td> <td></td> </tr> </table>	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp	$Rba$		$Rbc$		$Rba \wedge Rbc$		$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$		$Rac$			
<table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-bottom: 5px;"><math>Rab \wedge Rbc</math></td> <td style="padding-left: 5px;">Supp</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rba</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rbc</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rba \wedge Rbc</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;"><math>Rac</math></td> <td></td> </tr> </table>	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp	$Rba$		$Rbc$		$Rba \wedge Rbc$		$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$		$Rac$					
$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp															
$Rba$																
$Rbc$																
$Rba \wedge Rbc$																
$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$																
$Rac$																
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12														
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	$\forall$ Int $\times$ 3 14														

$Rbc$  is easy to get.  
 But how will we obtain  $Rba$ ? We'll **again** use the same trick we used below.

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem																					
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem																					
(3)	<table style="border-collapse: collapse; width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px; width: 15px;"><math>Rab \wedge Rbc</math></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Supp</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"><math>R_b \wedge R_a \rightarrow Rba</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"><math>Rba</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"><math>Rbc</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"><math>Rba \wedge Rbc</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"><math>Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"><math>Rac</math></td> <td></td> </tr> </table>	$Rab \wedge Rbc$		Supp		$R_b \wedge R_a \rightarrow Rba$			$Rba$			$Rbc$			$Rba \wedge Rbc$			$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$			$Rac$		
$Rab \wedge Rbc$		Supp																					
	$R_b \wedge R_a \rightarrow Rba$																						
	$Rba$																						
	$Rbc$																						
	$Rba \wedge Rbc$																						
	$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$																						
	$Rac$																						
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12																					
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	$\forall$ Int $\times$ 3 14																					

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem				
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem				
(3)	<table style="border-collapse: collapse; width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding-right: 5px;"><math>Rab \wedge Rbc</math></td> <td style="padding-left: 5px;"></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding-right: 5px; height: 100px;"> <math>Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba</math>  <math>Rba</math>  <math>Rbc</math>  <math>Rba \wedge Rbc</math>  <math>Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac</math>  <math>Rac</math> </td> <td style="padding-left: 5px;"></td> </tr> </table>	$Rab \wedge Rbc$		$Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba$ $Rba$ $Rbc$ $Rba \wedge Rbc$ $Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$ $Rac$		Supp
$Rab \wedge Rbc$						
$Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba$ $Rba$ $Rbc$ $Rba \wedge Rbc$ $Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$ $Rac$						
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12				
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	$\forall$ Int $\times$ 3 14				

Do not forget that you can instantiate two variables with  $a$ !

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem																								
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem																								
(3)	<table style="border-collapse: collapse; width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px; width: 15px;"><math>Rab \wedge Rbc</math></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Supp</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"><math>Rab \wedge Raa</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"><math>Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"><math>Rba</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"><math>Rbc</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"><math>Rba \wedge Rbc</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"><math>Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac</math></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"><math>Rac</math></td> <td></td> </tr> </table>	$Rab \wedge Rbc$		Supp		$Rab \wedge Raa$			$Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba$			$Rba$			$Rbc$			$Rba \wedge Rbc$			$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$			$Rac$		
$Rab \wedge Rbc$		Supp																								
	$Rab \wedge Raa$																									
	$Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba$																									
	$Rba$																									
	$Rbc$																									
	$Rba \wedge Rbc$																									
	$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$																									
	$Rac$																									
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12																								
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	$\forall$ Int $\times$ 3 14																								

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem
(3)	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp
(4)	$Rab$	$\wedge$ Elim
	$Rab \wedge Raa$	
	$Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba$	
	$Rba$	
	$Rbc$	
	$Rba \wedge Rbc$	
	$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	
	$Rac$	
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	$\forall$ Int $\times$ 3 14

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem
(3)	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp
(4)	$Rab$	$\wedge$ Elim
(5)	$Raa$	$\forall$ Elim 1
	$Rab \wedge Raa$	
	$Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba$	
	$Rba$	
	$Rbc$	
	$Rba \wedge Rbc$	
	$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	
	$Rac$	
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	$\forall$ Int $\times$ 3 14

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem
(3)	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp
(4)	$Rab$	$\wedge$ Elim
(5)	$Raa$	$\forall$ Elim 1
(6)	$Rab \wedge Raa$	$\wedge$ Int 4,5
(7)	$Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba$	$\forall$ Elim $\times 3$ 2
(8)	$Rba$	MP 7,6
(9)	$Rbc$	$\wedge$ Elim 3
(10)	$Rba \wedge Rbc$	$\wedge$ Int 8,9
(11)	$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	$\forall$ Elim $\times 3$ 2
(12)	$Rac$	MP 11,10
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	$\forall$ Int $\times 3$ 14