

Show that any binary relation that is both reflexive and Euclidean is transitive, i.e., show that

$$\forall x Rxx, (\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz) \vdash (\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz).$$

(1) $\forall x Rxx$

Prem

(2) $\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$

Prem

As always, first write down your premises, leave some blank space, and write down your conclusion.

(14) $(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz) \quad \forall \text{Int} \times 3 \quad 14$

(1) $\forall x Rxx$ Prem

(2) $\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$ Prem

(14) $(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$ \forall Int \times 3 14

Next, look at the conclusion. What is the main operator(s)?
What strategy does it suggest?

(1) $\forall x Rxx$ Prem

(2) $\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$ Prem

(14) $(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$ $\forall\text{Int} \times 3$ 14

Since it is a sequence of three \forall s, we will reach 10 by using $\forall\text{Int} \times 3$.

(1) $\forall x Rxx$ Prem

(2) $\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$ Prem

(14) $(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$ $\forall \text{Int} \times 3$ 14

As a result, what formula should be taken as subgoal?

(1) $\forall x Rxx$ Prem

(2) $\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$ Prem

(13) $Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$ CP 3-12

(14) $(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$ $\forall\text{Int} \times 3$ 14

Notice that the choice of a, b, c doesn't matter, as long as the two conditions on $\forall\text{Int}$ (remember?) are met.

(1) $\forall x Rxx$ Prem

(2) $\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$ Prem

(13) $Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$ CP 3-12

(14) $(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$ \forall Int \times 3 14

Now, this subgoal is a conditional. So our sub-subgoal is a CP.

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem				
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem				
(3)	<table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding-right: 5px; vertical-align: top;"> <table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-bottom: 5px;">$Rab \wedge Rbc$</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;">Rac</td> </tr> </table> </td> <td style="padding-left: 5px;"></td> </tr> </table>	<table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-bottom: 5px;">$Rab \wedge Rbc$</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;">Rac</td> </tr> </table>	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Rac		Supp
<table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-bottom: 5px;">$Rab \wedge Rbc$</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;">Rac</td> </tr> </table>	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Rac				
$Rab \wedge Rbc$						
Rac						
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12				
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	\forall Int \times 3 14				

As always, for CP, we write the antecedent of the subgoal on the first line of the subproof, and the consequence on the last line.

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem						
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem						
(3)	<table style="border-collapse: collapse; width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; width: 15%; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">$Rab \wedge Rbc$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Supp</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Rac</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> </tr> </table>		$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp		Rac		
	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp						
	Rac							
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12						
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	\forall Int \times 3 14						

Here's a good trick for such deductions: Make Rac match the consequent of the second premise, to reach our sub-subgoal by MP.

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem									
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem									
(3)	<table style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding-right: 5px; width: 15px;"></td> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-left: 5px;">$Rab \wedge Rbc$</td> <td style="padding-left: 5px; vertical-align: top;">Supp</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding-right: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding-left: 5px;">$R_a \wedge R_c \rightarrow Rac$</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding-right: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding-left: 5px;">Rac</td> <td></td> </tr> </table>		$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp		$R_a \wedge R_c \rightarrow Rac$			Rac		
	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp									
	$R_a \wedge R_c \rightarrow Rac$										
	Rac										
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12									
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	\forall Int \times 3 14									

That means we'll instantiate y with a and z with c in line 2.

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem
(3)	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp
	$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	
	Rac	
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	\forall Int \times 3 14

But what will we instantiate x with? We'll try to match information we've already got. b would be a good guess.

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem										
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem										
(3)	<table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding-right: 5px; vertical-align: top;"> <table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-bottom: 5px;">$Rab \wedge Rbc$</td> <td style="padding-left: 5px;">Supp</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;">$Rba \wedge Rbc$</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;">$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;">Rac</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> </td> <td></td> </tr> </table>	<table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-bottom: 5px;">$Rab \wedge Rbc$</td> <td style="padding-left: 5px;">Supp</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;">$Rba \wedge Rbc$</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;">$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;">Rac</td> <td></td> </tr> </table>	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp	$Rba \wedge Rbc$		$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$		Rac			
<table border="0" style="border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-bottom: 5px;">$Rab \wedge Rbc$</td> <td style="padding-left: 5px;">Supp</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;">$Rba \wedge Rbc$</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;">$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px 0 5px 10px;">Rac</td> <td></td> </tr> </table>	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp	$Rba \wedge Rbc$		$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$		Rac					
$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp											
$Rba \wedge Rbc$												
$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$												
Rac												
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12										
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	\forall Int \times 3 14										

Let's try to deduce the antecedent to set up our MP.

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem						
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem						
(3)	<table style="border-collapse: collapse; width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; width: 10%;"></td> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding-right: 10px;">$Rab \wedge Rbc$</td> <td style="padding-left: 10px;">Supp</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; height: 100px;"></td> <td style="padding-left: 10px;"> Rba Rbc $Rba \wedge Rbc$ $Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$ Rac </td> <td></td> </tr> </table>		$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp		Rba Rbc $Rba \wedge Rbc$ $Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$ Rac		
	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp						
	Rba Rbc $Rba \wedge Rbc$ $Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$ Rac							
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12						
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	\forall Int \times 3 14						

Rbc is easy to get.
 But how will we obtain *Rba*? We'll **again** use the same trick we used below.

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem				
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem				
(3)	<table style="border-collapse: collapse; width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px; width: 15px;">$Rab \wedge Rbc$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; height: 100px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;"> $R_b \wedge R_a \rightarrow Rba$ Rba Rbc $Rba \wedge Rbc$ $R_{\underline{b}a} \wedge R_{\underline{b}c} \rightarrow Rac$ Rac </td> </tr> </table>	$Rab \wedge Rbc$			$R_b \wedge R_a \rightarrow Rba$ Rba Rbc $Rba \wedge Rbc$ $R_{\underline{b}a} \wedge R_{\underline{b}c} \rightarrow Rac$ Rac	Supp
$Rab \wedge Rbc$						
	$R_b \wedge R_a \rightarrow Rba$ Rba Rbc $Rba \wedge Rbc$ $R_{\underline{b}a} \wedge R_{\underline{b}c} \rightarrow Rac$ Rac					
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12				
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	\forall Int \times 3 14				

(1) $\forall x Rxx$ Prem

(2) $\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$ Prem

(3) $Rab \wedge Rbc$ Supp

$R_{\underline{a}b} \wedge R_{\underline{a}a} \rightarrow Rba$

Rba

Rbc

$Rba \wedge Rbc$

$R_{\underline{b}a} \wedge R_{\underline{b}c} \rightarrow Rac$

Rac

(13) $Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$ CP 3-12

(14) $(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$ \forall Int \times 3 14

Do not forget that you can instantiate two variables with a !

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem																								
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem																								
(3)	<table style="border-collapse: collapse; width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px; width: 5%;"></td> <td style="border-bottom: 1px solid black; padding: 5px; width: 40%;">$Rab \wedge Rbc$</td> <td style="padding: 5px; width: 55%;">Supp</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">$Rab \wedge Raa$</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">$Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba$</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Rba</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Rbc</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">$Rba \wedge Rbc$</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="border-right: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Rac</td> <td></td> </tr> </table>		$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp		$Rab \wedge Raa$			$Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba$			Rba			Rbc			$Rba \wedge Rbc$			$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$			Rac		
	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp																								
	$Rab \wedge Raa$																									
	$Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba$																									
	Rba																									
	Rbc																									
	$Rba \wedge Rbc$																									
	$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$																									
	Rac																									
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12																								
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	\forall Int \times 3 14																								

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem
(3)	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp
(4)	Rab	\wedge Elim
	$Rab \wedge Raa$	
	$Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba$	
	Rba	
	Rbc	
	$Rba \wedge Rbc$	
	$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	
	Rac	
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	\forall Int \times 3 14

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem
(3)	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp
(4)	Rab	\wedge Elim
(5)	Raa	\forall Elim 1
	$Rab \wedge Raa$	
	$Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba$	
	Rba	
	Rbc	
	$Rba \wedge Rbc$	
	$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	
	Rac	
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	\forall Int \times 3 14

(1)	$\forall x Rxx$	Prem
(2)	$\forall x, y, z (Rxy \wedge Rxz \rightarrow Ryz)$	Prem
(3)	$Rab \wedge Rbc$	Supp
(4)	Rab	\wedge Elim
(5)	Raa	\forall Elim 1
(6)	$Rab \wedge Raa$	\wedge Int 4,5
(7)	$Rab \wedge Raa \rightarrow Rba$	\forall Elim $\times 3$ 2
(8)	Rba	MP 7,6
(9)	Rbc	\wedge Elim 3
(10)	$Rba \wedge Rbc$	\wedge Int 8,9
(11)	$Rba \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	\forall Elim $\times 3$ 2
(12)	Rac	MP 11,10
(13)	$Rab \wedge Rbc \rightarrow Rac$	CP 3-12
(14)	$(\forall x, y, z)(Rxy \wedge Ryz \rightarrow Rxz)$	\forall Int $\times 3$ 14